# Applying A-B-G and Crush Factor Values to the Evaluation of Impact Speed from Crush Damage for Frontal Crush to the 1989-1996 Ford Thunderbird

Daniel W. Vomhof III ACTAR # 484

4N6XPRT Systems® 8387 University Avenue La Mesa, CA 91941-3842 Phone (619) 464-3478 Fax (619) 464-2206 4n6xprt@4n6xprt.com

## Prepared for:

The Conference on Reconstruction And Safety on the Highway '98 Conference

October 26-30, 1998 College Station, Texas

### **Introduction:**

In the time frame of 1983 to 1998 there has been a switch in "mainstream" thinking and practice with regards to calculating speed from crush within the Accident Reconstruction community. In 1983 it was not uncommon to hear a statement like "You can't calculate vehicle speed from crush because there are too many uncertainties" made within an Accident Investigation/Reconstruction course. These comments were made despite the existence of formulas to compute the speed from crush and the development of the CRASH (Calspan Reconstruction of Accident Speeds on the Highway) model. One source of data was J. Stannard Baker's "Traffic Accident Investigation Manual" which cites a drag factor of -20 for a car crash into a solid fixed object<sup>1</sup>. Today there are week long courses where the calculation of speed from crush is one of the major, if not the major, topic of the course. These courses primarily concentrate on the application of some flavor of the CRASH model.

#### A-B-G Stiffness Values - Sources and problems:

Of prime importance to the application of the current generation of the CRASH model are the A-B-G stiffness values. Values of A-B-G may be obtained for a large number of vehicles from a variety of sources, including deriving the data from the NHTSA or other crash test results yourself. Other sources of this data include 4N6XPRT Systems<sup>2</sup>, Neptune Engineering, Inc. (NEI)<sup>3</sup>, Accident Reconstruction Journal<sup>4</sup>, and various SAE papers.

Use of the CRASH models "determination" of speed based upon crush damage has a number of potential pitfalls as detailed below:

Problems with the data and derived A-B-G values include:

- Reliance on one crash test for data will generate a "correct" calculated speed only for that crash. Speed calculations for other crashes will be "incorrect" to some degree.
- Reliance on an averaged set of A-B-G values will generate "incorrect" speed values for all of the "non-average" crashes, and most likely for the actual crash in question.
- Calculation of A-B-G values are directly dependent upon a damage width measurement. Depending upon your school of thought (Pre-CRASH3 v. Post-CRASH3) the "correct" damage width is either the contact damage only (Pre-CRASH3), or contact plus induced damage up to the maximum pre-crash dimension (Post- CRASH3).
- Due to the fact that data are not available all vehicles for all model years they were manufactured, the A-B-G values often need to be generated based upon a similar (sister or clone) vehicle.
- When no crash data is available for the vehicle model year in question, or an identified similar (sister or clone) vehicle, one must resort to either default vehicle stiffness values such as those provided by NHTSA based on vehicle wheelbase and weight, or apply the WAGNER\*\* method in choosing a "similar" vehicle which has been tested.

- Seldom are the "real" crashes a duplication of the test crashes.

Problems with the <u>application</u> of the data and derived A-B-G values to a "real" crash include:

- Data gathered from the vehicle(s) may be incomplete or inadequate
- Data gathered from the vehicle(s) may be incorrect
- Data which should have been gathered from the vehicle(s) is non-existent
- Data is incomplete, inadequate, AND incorrect

The problems with the answers derived by application of A-B-G values to a "real" crash include:

- The equations are sensitive to changes in the A-B-G values.
- The equations are sensitive to widely varying crush measurements.
- The speeds determined through the use of A-B-G values tend to give the Accident Investigator/ Reconstructionist a sense of precision, accuracy, and correctness which may be, and probably is, false!
- The answers are usually arrived at by plugging numbers into a computer program and printing out results. The program uses formulas to achieve these results that the user only partially understands, if at all (The term GIGO comes to mind).
- Even when the user understands and can duplicate the speed from damage calculations without the help of a computer, rapid calculation is ONLY possible through the use of a computer or programmable calculator.

#### The A-B-G Envelope Values Derived from NHTSA Crash Test Data:

The "standard" form that A-B-G values have taken to date are A) One set of values, which are B) based on a "no damage" speed of typically in the range of 4-5 mph, and C) based on an average crush depth. In discussions with a number of reconstructionists around the United States, the request for an alternative form of A-B-G values has been made repeatedly over the last 3 years. In making this request the following wishes have been expressed:

- Let the Reconstructionist exercise his/her judgement as to the measurement(s) to use and the appropriate "no damage" speed instead of making all of the decisions for them.
- Allow for quick "ranging" of speeds.
- Present the data in a "clean" format.
- Present the data, and results, so that the results can be duplicated, if needed, by the Reconstructionist.

In answer to these requests, we have developed an "envelope" of twelve A-B-G values using four different "no damage" speeds and three different crush measurements. The three measurements used are Minimum, Average, and Maximum crush as reported by NHTSA. These values are calculated from the measurements taken at the two "ends" of the damage and the "centerline". For each of these crush measurements, a set of A-B-G values are calculated for

no damage speeds of 2.5, 5.0, 7.5 and 10.0 mph for front and rear impact tests, and at 1.0, 2.0, 3.0, and 5.0 mph for side impact tests.

## Alternative Methods to Determine Speed from Crush:

In 1968, R. I. Emori presented a formula in SAE paper 680016 for determining vehicle impact speed into a barrier based upon the maximum permanent crush measurement<sup>5</sup>. This formula is simply:

v = 1.1 \* C

#### Where:

v = speed, (miles/hour) C = maximum permananent crush, (in)

Although this formula tends to underestimate the speed of present day vehicles and is not considered further here, it is important for the following three reasons: 1) the date of its publication, 2) its simplicity of use, and 3) the measurements it considers.

As mentioned previously, J. Stannard Baker presented a "f" value of -20 for a car crash into a barrier as early as 1975. 4N6XPRT Systems® has further refined this value and published it in the Expert AutoStats® program as a Crush Factor (CF) value of 21.

## Formulas Employed:

CF

 $V_{mph}$ 

Both the A-B-G values and the CF values are determined through the use of standard formulas. One source for these formulas is the "Equation Directory for the Reconstructionist"

A	=	Constant (stiffness coefficient), Maximum force per inch of damage width without permanent damage, lb/in
В .	_	Constant (stiffness coefficient), Crush resistance per inch of damage width, lb/in <sup>2</sup>
G	=	Constant (stiffness coefficient), Energy dissipated without permanent damage, lb
g	=	Acceleration of gravity, $32.2 \text{ ft/sec}^2 = 386.4 \text{ in/sec}^2$
g b <sub>o</sub>	=	Intercept (no damage speed. In our tables: Front & Rear = 2.5, 5.0, 7.5, and
		10.0  mph. Side = 1.0, 2.0, 3.0,  and  5.0  mph),  in/sec
$b_1$	=	Slope of the speed v. crush relation (change in impact speed to the change in crush), 1/sec
		• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •
$V_i$	=	Impact velocity of test vehicle, in/sec
$C_r$	=	Crush measurement from test vehicle (In our tables: Minimum, Average, and
•		Maximum crush), in
$L_{T}$	=	Width of crush (of test vehicle), in
$\mathbf{W}_{\mathtt{T}}$	=	Static Weight (of test vehicle(s)), lb
E	=	Energy dissipated due to crush, in*lb

Crush Factor (of test vehicle), dimensionless Impact velocity of test vehicle, miles/hour

First step is to calculate the slope of the speed versus the crush relation:

$$b_1 = \frac{V_i - b_0}{C_r}$$
 (1 / sec)

Where:

$$V_i = V_{mph} * \frac{12 \ inch|foot*5280 \ feet|mile}{3600 \ seconds|hour}$$
 (in | sec)

and

$$b_0$$
=(No damage speed)<sub>mph</sub>\*  $\frac{12 inch/foot*5280 feet/mile}{3600 seconds/hour}$  (in / sec)

Next step, calculate the A stiffness value:

$$A = \frac{W_T * b_0 * b_1}{g * L_T} \quad (lb \mid in)$$

Next step, calculate the B stiffness value:

$$B = \frac{W_T * b_1^2}{g * L_T} \quad (lb / in^2)$$

Finally, calculate the G stiffness value:

$$G = \frac{A^2}{2*B} \quad (lb)$$

The reverse calculation of speed from the derived A-B-G values to check their validity is completed by first using a Two Point Damage Profile equation to determine the Energy absorbed by the crush deformation:

$$E = (1 + \tan^2 \sigma) * L_T * \left[ \frac{A}{2} * (C_1 + C_2) + (\frac{B}{6}) * (C_1^2 + (C_1 * C_2) + C_2^2) + G \right] \quad (in * lb)$$

For the purposes of checking frontal impact tests, the equation is simplified as follows:

$$\sigma = 0$$

Therefore: 
$$(1 + \tan^2 \sigma) = 1$$

Leaving the simplified equation

$$E = L_T * \left[ \frac{A}{2} * (2 * C_r) + (\frac{B}{6}) * (3 * C_r^2) + G \right] \quad (in * lb)$$

Where  $C_r$  is the Minimum, Average, or Maximum Crush measurement from the test

The next step is to calculate the *ebv* (equivalent barrier velocity) for vehicle. This is more properly called the KE Equivalent Speed, the speed equivalent to the Kinetic Energy necessary to cause the crush deformation in the vehicle. This speed is calculated as follows:

$$ebv = \sqrt{\frac{\frac{(2*\frac{E}{12 \text{ inches/foot}}*\gamma)}{W_T}}{(\frac{W_T}{32.2 \text{ feet/second/second}})}} \quad (ft \text{ / sec})$$

and

$$Speed = ebv * \frac{3600seconds/hour}{5280feet/mile}$$
 (miles/hour)

For the purposes of checking frontal impact tests, the equation is simplified as follows:

$$\gamma = \frac{k^2}{k^2 + F_{MA}^2}$$

Where  $k^2$  is the Yaw Radius of Gyration and  $F_{MA}$  is the Moment arm of Force offset from the vehicle CG.

On Full Frontal Barrier Tests  $F_{MA} = 0$ 

Therefore: 
$$\gamma = \frac{k^2}{k^2} = 1$$

Thus:

$$ebv = \sqrt{\frac{\frac{2*E}{12 \ inches|foot}}{\frac{W_T}{32.2 \ feet|second|second}}} \quad (ft \mid sec)$$

and

$$Speed=ebv*\frac{3600\ seconds/hour}{5280\ feet/mile} \quad (miles/hour)$$

By comparison, the Crush Factor (CF) is calculated in the same way that a coefficient of friction or drag factor would be calculated from a set of test skids. As stated in the Expert AutoStats<sup>®</sup> program, it is based on the maximum crush measurement:

$$CF = \frac{V_{mph} * V_{mph}}{\frac{C_{r_{max}} inch}{12 inch|foot}}$$
 (dimensionless)

Note that the crush measurement is converted from inches to feet as a part of the calculation.

The reverse calculation of speed from the derived CF value to check its validity is completed using the Minimum Speed from Skid formula as follows:

$$Speed = \sqrt{30*CF*(\frac{C_r inches}{12 inches/foot})} \quad (miles/hour)$$

Note that the crush measurement is again converted from inches to feet as a part of the calculation. When applying the CF value to calculate a speed from crush value, the crush distance must be in feet. The major source of error in using this formula is a failure to convert the crush measurement from inches to feet.

## Reference Data - CRASH 98 Ford Thunderbird Test Vehicles:

Pages A-14 through A-21 are the Expert VIN DeCoder® and Expert AutoStats® output for the 1989 Ford Thunderbird vehicles to be tested at The Crash 98 Conference.

Pages A-22 through A-54 are the NHTSA Crash Test Reports for the four crash tests which test the 1989 through 1994 Ford Thunderbird 2 door Coupes. This is a portion of the year range 1989-1996 identified by the Sisters/Clones<sup>8</sup> list as representing the "same" vehicle. This year range is also included in the Mitchell Manual<sup>9</sup> for the Ford Thunderbird as having substantially interchangeable major body parts. The Sisters/Clones list also identifies the Mercury Cougar as being a sister/similar vehicle. There are no crash tests within the year range of 1989-1996 in the NHTSA crash test database for frontal impact tests for the Mercury Cougar.

Pages A-55 through A-73 give further information regarding how NHTSA tests vehicles, and how to interpret some of the results reported as part of the NHTSA crash test database.

### The Expert AutoStats Crush Factor (CF) Value:

In calculating speeds from crush damage, an alternative to the CRASH3 model is the use of a Crush Factor (CF) as published in the Expert AutoStats<sup>®</sup> three page printed reports. The CF values listed in that program were arrived at in late 1991 after analyzing the NHTSA crash test data as published in the Accident Reconstruction Journal up to that time.

The goal of determining these CF values was two fold. The first goal was to provide a means of rapidly calculating a speed from crush damage where the crush measurement was readily determined (maximum crush) and should not vary significantly from one data gatherer to another. The second goal was to provide a means of rapidly calculating a speed from crush damage where the calculation was simple to complete, readily explainable, used formulas already familiar to the Accident Reconstructionist, and was not overly sensitive to differences in crush measurement or vehicle-to-vehicle variations. We believe that we have achieved both of these goals.

In the stiffness calculation sheets which are a part of the NHTSA Crash Reports provided

by 4N6XPRT Systems<sup>®</sup>, a comparison of the speed calculated per the method contained in Expert AutoStats<sup>®</sup> is made against the reported Impact speed for the subject test. A calculated Test Specific CF value for that test is also provided. This data is provided in addition to the A-B-G Envelope values.

There are two immediately recognizable applications for the Test Specific CF value. The first application is to use the Test Specific CF value instead of or in addition to the Standard CF value included in Expert AutoStats® to the calculation of speed from the crush damage. The second application of the Test Specific CF value is as a general guide to how "stiff" or "soft" the vehicle is when compared to the "average vehicle" which has the stiffness values stated in Expert AutoStats®.

A third application of the Test Specific CF value comes into play when more than one test has been conducted on a subject vehicle. The Test Specific CF value then becomes a measuring stick for comparing how similar or different the response to impact is from vehicle to vehicle and speed to speed. An application of this measuring stick to NHTSA Test #1282, 1390, and 2240 (Table 6) indicates that the Ford Thunderbird in Test #1282 was somewhat "stiffer" than average and that the Ford Thunderbird's in Test #1390 and 2240 were somewhat "softer" than average. Therefore, speed estimates derived from data contained in Test #1282 will be expected to OVERESTIMATE the impact speeds of Test # 1390 and 2240. Similarly, Test # 1390 and 2240 will be expected to provide similar "confirming" speed estimates of each other and UNDERESTIMATE the impact speed of Test #1282.

## A-B-G Envelope & CF Value Application to NHTSA Tests 1282, 1390, & 2044:

Tables 1 through 24 on pages A1 through A13 summarize some of the results contained in the stiffness calculation sheets located on pages on A-29, A-37, A-45, A-46, and A-54. Table 13 and Table 24 summarize the data on Tables 1 through 12 and Tables 14 through 23, respectively.

Table 1 summarizes the data needed to derive the A-B-G and CF values from the crash tests. Test # 2047, due to reporting errors either by the testing entity or during input into the NHTSA database, has none of the needed crush depth measurements. Therefore no estimate values will be able to be derived from this test.

Test # 2047 was included both for the information contained in other areas of the report and as an example of some of the data errors within the NHTSA crash test database which should be expected.

Table 2 and Table 3 illustrate the A-B-G and Test Specific CF values derived for test #1282 and # 1390 respectively.

Table 4 illustrates the A-B-G and Test Specific CF values derived for test # 2044 both for the "Full" width crush length as well as the Crush Indentation Length.

The A-B-G values for these three tables were calculated from the Minimum, Average, and Maximum crush measurements using a "no damage" speed of 5.0 mph. The Test Specific

CF value for each test was calculated from the Maximum Crush as specified in the Expert AutoStats® program.

Table 5 contains the "Generic" stiffness values and a statistical analysis of the A-B-G values.

- The first three rows of the "Generic" values are the average A, B, and G values for test # 1282, test # 1390, and the "Full" width values for test # 2044 using a "no damage" speed of 5.0 mph and the Minimum, Average and Maximum crush measurements calculated for each test.
- Row four contains the average NEI A & B values (with the G value calculated from those A & B values).
- Row five contains the NHTSA Default table values from Column 4.
- Row six contains the Standard CF value of 21 from the Expert AutoStats® program.

The commonly used statistical measures of Minimum, Average, Median, Maximum, Population Standard Deviation and Sample Standard Deviation are applied to the A, B, and G values found in rows one through 5 of the upper box in <u>Table 5</u>. It should be realized that the measures were applied to each value as a separate entity, rather than as a part of a set. Thus, applying the Minimum A, B, and G values as an A-B-G set would be an incorrect application of these values.

Table 6 is a tabulation of the Test Specific CF values and an application of the commonly used statistical measures of Minimum, Average, Median, Maximum, Population Standard Deviation and Sample Standard Deviation. It can be seen, and may be surprising to some people, that even in this small sample size of three tests the average Test Specific CF value rapidly approaches the Standard CF value of 21 from the Expert AutoStats<sup>®</sup> program. The fact that it does is one validation of the Standard CF value.

Tables 7 through 10 check the validity of the stiffness values derived in Tables 2 through 4. Table 7 tests the stiffness values derived in Table 2, Table 8 tests the stiffness values derived in Table 3, and Table 9 and Table 10 test the stiffness values derived in Table 4 by calculating theoretical impact speeds of the three tests based on those stiffness values. A calculated impact speed using the Standard CF value is also included in each table for reference purposes. The darker, larger speed values are the values obtained by comparing apples to apples and oranges to oranges. In other words, the speed calculated from Minimum Crush, based on stiffness values obtained from the minimum crush is highlighted, as is speed from Average Crush using Average Crush derived A-B-G values, etc. This is one method of developing the impact speed envelope from stiffness values based on one test crash.

<u>Table 11</u> contains theoretical impact speed calculations based upon the "Generic" stiffness values derived in <u>Table 5</u>. The highlighted speeds are highlighted in the same manner as the highlighted values in <u>Tables 7 through 10</u>.

Table 12 is another application of the commonly used statistical measures of Minimum, Average, Median, Maximum, Population Standard Deviation and Sample Standard Deviation. This time the measures are applied to the calculated speeds in Table 11. The speeds calculated with the Standard CF value are also included for reference purposes. It can rapidly be seen that the Standard CF value estimates a speed that is very similar to the average speed determined by the A-B-G values.

Table 13 contains a summary of the Minimum, Average, and Maximum crush A-B-G values calculated for test numbers 1282, 1390, and 2044 at a 5.0 mph "no damage" value. These values are then used to calculate a speed for each of the tests based on those values as a check of the reliability of those A-B-G values.

Table 14 and Table 15 illustrate the A-B-G and Test Specific CF values derived for test #1282 and # 1390 respectively.

Table 16 illustrates the A-B-G and Test Specific CF values derived for test # 2044 both for the "Full" width crush length as well as the Crush Indentation Length.

The A-B-G values for these three tables were calculated from the calculated Average crush measurements using a range of "no damage" speeds of 2.5 mph, 5.0 mph, ad 7.5 mph. The Test Specific CF value for each test was calculated from the Maximum Crush as specified in the Expert AutoStats<sup>®</sup> program.

Table 17 contains the "Generic" stiffness values and a statistical analysis of the A-B-G values.

- The first three rows of the "Generic" values are the average A, B, and G values for test # 1282, test # 1390, and the "Full" width values for test # 2044 using "no damage" speeds of 2.5 mph, 5.0 mph, and 7.5 mph and the average crush measurement calculated for each test.
- Row four contains the average NEI A & B values (with the G value calculated from those A & B values).
- Row five contains the NHTSA Default table values from Column 4.
- Row six contains the Standard CF value of 21 from the Expert AutoStats® program.

The commonly used statistical measures of Minimum, Average, Median, Maximum, Population Standard Deviation and Sample Standard Deviation are applied to the A, B, and G values found in rows one through 5 of the upper box in <u>Table 17</u>. It should be realized that the measures were applied to each value as a separate entity, rather than as a part of a set. Thus, applying the Minimum A, B, and G values as an A-B-G set would be an incorrect application of these values.

<u>Tables 18 through 21</u> check the validity of the stiffness values derived in <u>Tables 14</u> through 16. <u>Table 18</u> tests the stiffness values derived in <u>Table 14</u>, <u>Table 19</u> tests the stiffness

values derived in <u>Table 15</u>, and <u>Table 20</u> and <u>Table 21</u> test the stiffness values derived in <u>Table 16</u> by calculating theoretical impact speeds of the three tests based on those stiffness values. A calculated impact speed using the Standard CF value is also included in each table for reference purposes. The darker, larger speed values are the values obtained by comparing pears to pears and plums to plums. These values are highlighted similarly to <u>Tables 7 through 10</u>. In other words, the speed calculated from a no damage speed of 2.5 mph and average crush, based on stiffness values obtained from a no damage speed of 2.5 mph and average crush. This ranging of the "no damage" speed is another way of building the impact speed envelope based upon stiffness values developed from one test crash.

Table 22 contains theoretical impact speed calculations based upon the "Generic" stiffness values derived in Table 17. The highlighted speeds are highlighted in the same manner as the highlighted values in Tables 7 through 11 and Tables 18 through 21.

Table 23 is another application of the commonly used statistical measures of Minimum, Average, Median, Maximum, Population Standard Deviation and Sample Standard Deviation. This time the measures are applied to the calculated speeds in Table 22. The speeds calculated with the Standard CF value are also included for reference purposes. It can rapidly be seen that the again the Standard CF value estimates a speed that is very similar to the average speed determined by the A-B-G values.

Table 24 contains a summary of the A-B-G values calculated for "no damage" speeds of 2.5, 5.0 and 7.5 mph using the average crush measurements from each of the tests. These values are then used to calculate a speed for each of the tests based on those values as a check of the reliability of those A-B-G values.

For comparison purposes, Test Specific CF and "Generic" A-B-G values are also included in the <u>Table 13</u> and <u>Table 24</u> data summarizations.

Only the "Full Width" tests are used for the back check speed calculations due to damage being recorded across the full width of each of the vehicles.

## Examination of <u>Table 13</u> and <u>Table 24</u> shows that:

- The A-B-G and CF values calculated for tests # 1282 underestimate the speed of test #1390 and 2044 as predicted from our Test Specific CF measuring stick.

- The A-B-G and CF values calculated for tests # 1390 and 2044 provide reasonable speed estimates for each other, however both tend to over estimate the speed for test # 1282, again as predicted from our Test Specific CF measuring stick.

## Examination of <u>Table 11</u> and <u>Table 22</u> shows that:

- The average stiffness values calculated from the three tests underestimate the speed of test # 1282 by 2-4 mph, overestimate the impact speed of test # 1390 by 1-2 mph, and overestimate the speed of test # 2044 by up to 4 mph.

1

- The NEI values underestimate the impact speed of test # 1282 by over 5 mph and Test # 1390 by about 1 mph. These values also slightly overestimate the impact speed

of test # 2044.

- The NHTSA Default Values underestimate the impact speed of all three tests by 5-10 mph.
- The Standard CF value of 21, when used as suggested in the Expert AutoStats® program, underestimates the impact speed of test # 1282 by 1-2 mph. This CF value overestimates the impact speed of test # 1390 by 2-3 mph and test # 2044 by 1-2 mph.
- The Standard CF value of 21, when used as suggested in the Expert AutoStats<sup>®</sup> program, estimates the impact speed of the three tests as well or better than any of the "Generic" A-B-G values.

## Other Useful Information in a NHTSA Crash Test Report

The Stiffness calculation sheets are only a small part of the NHTSA Crash Test report which is provided by 4N6XPRT Systems<sup>©</sup>. Additional sheets are provided for the General Test Information, Barrier or Impactor Information, Occupant (Dummy) Data, and Vehicle Data when the information is contained in the NHTSA database.

The General Test Information page covers basic information regarding the crash test and the test objectives. This information helps in determining why some information may be incomplete or non-existent, as well as likely reasons for data errors. One example of a possible data error is as follows - the data is now stored in the database in metric units. Early tests were measured in English units. If the original data was not converted before being entered into the current database, the results extracted from the database will be in error.

The Barrier Information page indicates the type of barrier or impactor which was used in the test. This information may be of use in evaluating what appear to be discrepancies in the amount of crush damage sustained from test to test by the vehicle.

The Occupant (Dummy) Data pages often include Left and Right Femur Peak Load(s), a HIC value, Chest Severity Index (TTI), Thorax (Chest) Peak acceleration, first and second contact areas for the crash dummy(s), and distance measurements from critical "body" parts to areas of the vehicle interior which are normally contacted by the occupants. This data is all potentially important when evaluating injury potential and/or causation in a traffic collision.

There are four "Injury Risk Function Curve" graphs within the supplemental material printed from the NHTSA web site. These graphs are located on pages A-58, A-59, and A-60. These graphs relate back to the loading and acceleration information contained in the Occupant (Dummy) Data pages.

#### Summary

- Impact speeds based on crush damage can be estimated, but not precisely and accurately calculated without considerable effort.
- ► The Standard Crush Factor (CF) published in the Expert AutoStats® program estimates speed from crush damage at least as well as the A-B-G values.

- The Standard CF can be used in the field to estimate the impact speed from the observed damage. This in turn may assist the Accident Investigator in documenting items at the scene through a better understanding of the accident itself.
- The Standard CF value may be used to quickly, but reliably "check" the Impact speed calculated through the use of A-B-G values.
- When necessary, the investigator or reconstructionist can use the Standard CF value in trial or deposition to reliably yet rapidly estimate "crush speed" in response to "what if's" and hypothetical questions without the use of a computer, or, if need be, a calculator.
- ▶ The Standard CF value meets the "scientific" requirements of "Daubert".
- The Test Specific Crush Factor can indicate whether the crash test vehicle is "stiffer" or "softer" than an "average" vehicle or other similar (sister or clone) vehicles which have also been tested.

#### Acknowledgements

It would be remiss of the author to not acknowledge the following people for their assistance in the preparation of this paper:

Daniel W. Vomhof, Ph.D. provided technical editing assistance in both the body of the paper and in Tables 1 through 24.

Sheryl Lynn Cozby-Vomhof provided editing assistance from a Lay perspective.

Marion J. Vomhof, Esq., Attorney at Law provided editing assistance from the perspective of a practicing attorney.

Without these three people, this paper would be much harder reading.

e1998-4N6XPRT Systems, 8387 University Avenue, La Mesa, CA 91941-All Riaghts Reserved
Phone: (619) 464-3478

Fax: (619) 464-2206

### **Definition of Terms**

#### Engineering Approaches (Methods):

- WAG

Wild Asked Guess - an educated estimate from experience.\*

- SWAG

Sophisticated Wild Asked Guess - an educated estimate from experience

combined with some calculations.\*

- WAGNER"

Wild Asked Guess Not Easily Refuted - an educated estimate from experience combined with lots of numbers and calculations which

selectively support, or mask problems with, the estimate.\*

\*Original source of definitions unknown, but author first learned these from Gary Stephens in Jacksonville, FL.

## Engineering Judgement:

The application of engineering education, training, and experience in determining the applicability of data, answers, and/or methods to resolving a problem.

## Reconstruction Judgement:

The application of education, training, and experience in Accident Investigation and Reconstruction in determining the applicability of data, answers, and/or methods to resolving one or more problems in a Traffic Collision. (i.e. - Time(s), Speed(s), Distance(s), Force(s), Avoidance Potential(s), etc.)

#### GIGO:

Garbage In - Garbage Out, a common computer term.

### No Damage Speed:

The maximum speed a vehicle can impact a barrier with no resulting permanent damage.

## Cited References

- 1. "Traffic Accident Investigation Manual", ©1975, The Traffic Institute, Northwestern University.
- 2. 4N6XPRT Systems<sup>®</sup>, 8387 University Avenue, La Mesa, CA 91941, Phone: (619) 464-3477, Fax: (619) 464-3477, E-mail: 4n6xprt@4n6xprt.com
- 3. Neptune Engineering, Inc., P.O. Box 1597, Clovis, CA 93613

.

- Accident Reconstruction Journal, P.O. Box 234, Waldorf, MD 20604, Phone: (301) 843-1371.
- 5. "Work, Energy and Speed from Damage in Traffic Accidents: Topic 870 of the *Traffic-Accident Investigation Manual*" by Gary W. Cooper, •1989, The Northwestern University Traffic Institute.
- 6. Expert AutoStats<sup>®</sup>, <sup>©</sup>1991-1998 4N6XPRT Systems<sup>®</sup>, 8387 University Avenue, La Mesa, CA 91941, Phone: 800-266-9778, Fax: (619) 464-3477, E-mail: 4n6xprt@4n6xprt.com
- 7. "Equation Directory for the Reconstructionist, Second Edition 1996" by Daniel J. Parkka, Institute of Police Technology and Management.
- 8. Vehicle Year & Model Interchange List (Sisters & Clones List), Gregory C. Anderson, Scalia Safety Engineering, 521 E. Washington Avenue, Suite 200, Madison, WI 53703, Phone: (608) 256-820
- 9. Mitchell<sup>®</sup> Collision Estimating Guide: Ford, <sup>®</sup>1997 Mitchell International, 9889 Willow Creek Road, San Diego, CA, 92196, Phone: (619) 578-6550.

## References for Additional Reading

"Understanding Delta V from Damage", • 1996 George M. Bonnett, J.D., available at www.rec-tec.com.

"BH<sub>2</sub>VK Crash Testing Project Seminar Notes: August 12-14, 1992", ©1992 BH<sub>2</sub>VK Engineering.

"Damage Analysis" by Timothy A. Moebes, PE, a paper presented at the Southwestern Association of Technical Accident Investigators July 18 & 19, 1997 in Phoenix, AZ.

Table 1 - General Information for the 1989-1994 Ford Thunderbird from NHTSA Crash Test Database

Weight
ž
Ξ
Ø
Ñ
Ñ
1

Table 2 - Derived Ford Thunderbird A-B-G & CF Values from NHTSA Test # 1282

	Maximum 21.1					21.1	21.1	
Crush in inches	Minimum Average Maximum 16.2 18.0 21.1				18.0			
5	MINIMUM 16.2			16.2				_
Crush Indentation Length	ncnes 72.7	- FW)	CF				22.8	
Vehicle Width	72.7	Full" Width	9	566.5	566.5	566.5		RR in/sec
Impact Speed	34.7	st #1282 ("	8	152.3	123.4	83.8		5 0 mph =
Weight	pounds 4110	m NHTSA Te	∢	415.4	373.9	319.0	щ	(FW)
<u> </u>	1989	Values Calculated from NHTSA Test #1282 ("Full" Width - FW)		Min Crush	Avg Crush	Max Crush	<b>Test Specific CF</b>	Width = $72.7''$ (FW) b0 = 5.0 mph = 88 in/sec
<b>1</b>	1282	Values					ר	
		-						-

Table 3 - Derived Ford Thunderbird A-B-G & CF Values from NHTSA Test # 1390

Crush in inches Minimum Average Maximum 16.2 17.4 19.7					19.7	19.7	
Crush in inches m Average Ma 17.4				17.4			
n Cr. Minimum 16.2			16.2				
Crush Indentation Length Inches N	th)	R	•			17.6	
Vehicle Width Inches 72.7	("Full" Wid	ဖ	563.8	563.8	563.8		38 in/sec
Impact Speed MPH 29.4	est #1390	В	102.3	88.3	69.2		0 mph = 8
Weight pounds 4090	rom NHTSA Te	۷	339.6	315.6	. 279.3	ı.	FW), $b0 = 5$ .
Year 1990	Values Calculated from NHTSA Test #1390 ("Full" Width		Min Crush	Avg Crush	Max Crush	Test Specific CF	Width = 72.7" (FW), $b0 = 5.0 \text{ mph} = 88 \text{ in/sec}$
Test # 1390	Valı						

Table 4 - Derived Ford Thunderbird A-B-G & CF Values from NHTSA Test # 2044

Crush in inches Minimum Average Maximum 23.5 24.1 25.0	25.0 25.0	25.0 25.0
Crush in inches m Average Ma 24.1	24.1	24.1
n Cı Minimum 23.5	23.5	23.5
Crush Indentation Length Inches M	th ) CF 19.6	h Only - IL) CF 19.6
Vehicle Width Inches 60.2	("Full" Wid 653.2 653.2 653.2 653.2 88 in/sec	etion Lengt G 693.5 693.5 693.5
Impact Speed MPH 35.0	TSA Test #2044 ("Full" W A B 33.5 85.2 65.2 25.2 81.0 653.2 13.5 75.2 653.2 b0 = 5.0 mph = 88 in/sec	est #2044 (Indentation Let A B G G S S S S S S S S S S S S S S S S S
Weight pounds 3924	A 333.5 325.2 325.2 313.5 V), b0 = {	A Test #20 A 354.1 345.3 332.9
Year 1994	Values Calculated from NHTSA Test #2044 ("Full" Width         A       B       G         Min Crush       333.5       85.2       653.2         Avg Crush       325.2       81.0       653.2         Max Crush       313.5       75.2       653.2         Test Specific CF         Width = 60.2" (FW), b0 = 5.0 mph = 88 in/sec	Values Calculated from NHTSA Test #2044 (Indentation Length Only - IL)         A       B       G       CF         Min Crush       354.1       90.4       693.5         Avg Crush       345.3       86.0       693.5         Max Crush       332.9       79.9       693.5         Test Specific CF       19.6         Width = 56.7" (IL).       b0 = 5.0 mph = 88 in/sec
Test # 2044	Va	Values Cal

Table 5 - "Generic" A-B-G & CF values for 1989-1994 Ford Thunderbird

"Gene	ric" Value	es			
AVG of FW values					7
("Full" Width)	Α	В	G	CF	
Min Crush	362.8	113.3	581.1		Average of Calculated A-B-G value
Avg Crush	338.2	97.6	586.3		from NHTSA test numbers
Max Crush	303.9	78.1	591.6		1282, 1390, and 2044 ("Full" Width
NEI A & B Average Values	267.0	88.0	405.1		
NHTSA Default Table - Col. 4	356.0	34.0	1863.8		
tandard CF from Expert AutoS	tats			21	
	o0 = 5.0 r			21	
	o0 = 5.0 r			21	]
	o0 = 5.0 r	ic" A-B-0	G values	21	]
Statistical Analysis o Minimum	o0 = 5.0 r of "Generi	ic" A-B-0 —————	G 405.1	21	
Statistical Analysis o	of "Generi A 267.0	B 34.0	G values	21	
Statistical Analysis of Minimum Average	of "Generi A 267.0 325.6	B 34.0 82.2	G 405.1 805.6	21	
Statistical Analysis of Minimum Average Median	of "Generi A 267.0 325.6 338.2	B 34.0 82.2 88.0	G 405.1 805.6 586.3	21	

Table 6 - Statistical Analysis of Test Specific CF Values for 1989-1994 Ford Thunderbird

*	Test Specific CF NHTSA	Values	1		
	Test Number	CF			
	1282	22.8			
	1390	17.6			
	2044	19.6			
			i		
	Statistical Analy Test Specific CF	Values			
	Test Specific CF  Minimum	Values 17.6			
	Test Specific CF  Minimum  Average	17.6 20.0		·	
	Test Specific CF  Minimum  Average  Median	17.6 20.0 19.6		·	
	Test Specific CF  Minimum  Average	17.6 20.0			
	Test Specific CF  Minimum  Average  Median	17.6 20.0 19.6			

Table 7 - Calculation of Impact speeds (MPH) for NHTSA Tests #1282, 1390, and 2044 based on A-B-G & CF Values calculated for Test # 1282

					Test 'An	Test "Actuel" impact Speed = 34.7 MPH	t Speed = H	Test "Ad	Test "Actual" impact Speed = 29.4 MPH	t Speed ≃ H	Test "Ach	Test "Actual" Impact Speed = 35.0 MPH	Speed
						Test # 1282	5	•	Test # 1390	0	-	Test # 2044	
Values Calculated from NHTSA	1 from NHTS4		12 PTE: MF: W/S		Speed C	Speed Calculation Based on:	Based on:	Speed C	alculation (	Based on:	Speed C	Iculation B	ased on
	<		B G G	1	Š	Crush	Crush	Crush	Cush dia	Crush	Crush Chash	Cresh	
Min Crush	h 415.4	152.3	586.5		34.7	38.0	34.7 38.0 43.7	34.8	37.0	41.2	44.8 45.8 47.3	45.8	47.3
Avg Crush	h 373.9	123.4	566.5		31.7	34.7	39.8	31.8	33.8	37.6	40.8	41.7	5.
Mex Crush	h 319.0	89.8	566.5		27.8	30.3	34.7	27.9	29.6	32.8	35.5	36.3	37.4
Test Sp	Test Specific CF			22.8	30.4	32.0	34.7	30.4	31.5	30.4 31.5 33.5	36.6	37.1	37.7
Standard	Standard CF from Expert /	t AutoStats		7	28.2	30.7	33,3	29.2	30.2	32.2	35.1	35.6	36.2
Width = 72	Width = 72.7" (FW), b0	50 = 5.0  mp	= 5.0  mph = 88  in/sec	g									

Table 8 - Calculation of Impact speeds (MPH) for NHTSA Tests #1282, 1390, and 2044 based on A-B-G & CF Values calculated for Test #1390

					Test "Act	Test "Actual" Impact Speed = 34.7 MPH	t Speed =	Test "Ad	Test "Actual" Impact Speed = 29.4 MPH	: Speed ≈	Test "Ach	Test "Actual" Impact Speed = 35.0 MPH	Spee
					Speed C.	Test # 1282 Alculation Ba	2 Jesed on:	Speed C	Test # 1390 Speed Calculation Based on;	) lased on:	L Speed	Test # 2044	- Pee
Values Calculated from NHTSA Test #1390 ("Full" Width)	THN mot	SA Test #1	390 (TFUIT)	Vidith)	Minimum	Average	Maximum	Minimum	Average	Maximum	Minimum	Average	Maxim
	<	<b>6</b>	ပ	ក	Sea	O G	Crush	Crush	Ses	Crueh	Cresh	25	δ
Min Crush	339.6	102.3	563.8		29.3	32.0	36.7	29.4	31.2	34.7	37.5	38.4	38.
Avg Crush	315.6	88.3	563.8		27.6	30.1	34.4	27.72	29.3	27.7 29.3 32.6	35.2 36.0 37.1	36.0	37.1
Mex Crush	279.3	69.2	563.8		25.0	27.2	31.1	8.	26.6	29.4	31.7	32.4	33,
Test Specific CF	A F S S			17.6	26.7	28.1	26.7 28.1 30.5	26.7	7.72	29.4	32.2	32.6	33.2
Standard CF from Expert		AutoStats		7	28.2	30.7	33.3	29.2	30.2	32.2	35.1	35.6	36.
Width = 72.7" (FW),		0 = 5.0 mp	b0 = 5.0  mph = 88  in/sec	٥									

Table 9 - Calculation of Impact speeds (MPH) for NHTSA Tests #1282, 1390, and 2044 based on A-B-G & CF Values calculated for Test # 2044 (FW)

					Test "Act	Test "Actual" Impact Speed = 34.7 MPH	t Speed =	Test "Ac	Test "Actual" Impact Speed = 29.4 MPH	t Speed = H	Test "Act	Test "Actual" impact Speed = 35.0 MPH	T Spee
						Test # 1282	Test # 1282		Test # 1390			Test # 2044	
Values Calculated ;	from NHTSA	Test #204	4 (TFURT WIG	_	Minima	Average	Xesed on: Maximum	Minimum	Average	Assection: Maximum	Ninimum	Average	
9 B V	4	æ	ပ	8	S	Q Feb	See See	Crush	S	Crish	Colege Colege	S	ð
Min Crush	333.5	86.2	653.2		27.6	30.0	34.3	27.6	29.3	27.6 29.3 32.5	35.0 35.8 36.9	35.8	8
Avg Crush	325.2	81.0	653.2		27.0	29.4	33.6	27.1	28.7	31.8	34.3	35.0	8
Max Crush	313.5	75.2	653.2		28.2	28.6	32.5	26.3	27.9	30.8	33.2	33.9	35.
Test Specific CF	r S			19.6	28.2	29.7	32.2	28.2	29.2	31.1	33.9	3.4	35.
Standard CF from Expert	om Expert Au	noStats	•	2	29.7	30.7	33.3	29.2	30.2	32.2	8.	35.6	36.
Width = 60.2"	(FW), b0.	b0 = 5.0 mph = 88 in/sec	= 88 in/sec		,								

Table 10 - Calculation of Impact speeds (MPH) for NHTSA Tests #1282, 1390, and 2044 based on A-B-G & CF Values calculated for Test # 2044 (IL.)

				·	Test "Act	Test "Actual" Impact Speed = 34.7 MPH	H.	Test "Ad	Test "Actual" Impact Speed = 29.4 MPH	H.	Test "Act	Test "Actuel" Impact Speed = 35.0 MPH	T Speed
					,	Test # 1282	2	•	Test # 139	0		Feet # 204	
Values Only defect the 200	C 100 L	24.4	1	į	Open	iculation	Based on:	Speed C	alculation	Besed on:	Speeds	Scutation E	
Values Carchetted from NT1 3A 165	A RECEIPT	B 8	K #2044 (Indentation Length Only - IL)	2 4	Cresh	Chesh chesh	Orush Crush Crush			Crush Crush Crush	Cough Crush Crush		2
Min Crush	354.1	406	683.5		28.4	31.0	35.3	28.5	30.2	33.4	36.1	36.9	38.0
Avg Crush	345.3	96.0	603.5		27.8	30.3	34.6	27.9	29.6	32.7	35.3	36.1	37.2
Max Crush	332.9	79.9	683.5		0.72	29.4	33.5	27.1	28.7	31.8	34.2	38.0	36.1
Test Specific CF	50			19.6	28.2	29.7	32.2	28.2	28.2	31.1	33.9	8	35.0
Standard OF from Expert Auto	om Expert Au	noStats		73	29.7	30.7	33.3	29.2	30.2	32.2	35.1	35.6	36.2
Width = 56.7" (IL),	" (IL), b0=	60 = 5.0  mph = 88  in/sex	= 88 in/sec										

Table 11 - Calculation of Impact speeds (MPH) for NHTSA Tests #1282, 1390, and 2044 based on "Generic" A-B-G & CF Values

					ę,	34.7 MPH	H	2	29.4 MPH	H	33.	35.0 MPH	H
f	"Generit:" V	<u> </u>			i Z	Test # 1282 alculation Re		. Cheens	Test # 1390	Speed on:	- C	Test # 204	
AVG of FW Values	ę				Minimum	Avecage	Maximum	Minimum	Average	Maximum	Minimum	Average	Maximum
("Full" Width)	⋖	Ф	g	გ	See	Sec.	Cresh Factor	Cresh	5	Cresh	Crush	5	5
Min Crush	362.8	113.3	594.5		30.7	33.5	38.4	30.8	32.7	36.3	39,3	40.2	41.5
Avg Crush	338.2	97.6	594.5		28.9	31.5	36.1	28.9	30.7	34.1	36.9	37.7	38.9
Max Crush	303.9	78.1	594.5		28.4	28.7	32.8	26.4	28.0	31.0	33.5	34.2	35.3
NEI A & B Average Values	267.0	88.0	405.1		26.8	29.3	33.6	26.9	28.5	31.8	34.4	35.2	36.4
NHTSA Default Table - Col. 4 356.0	4 356.0	34.0	1863.8		23.1	24.7	27.3	23.2	24.2	26.2	27.4	27.9	28.6
Standard CF from Expert Aut	oStats			7	29.2	30.7	33.3	29.2	30.2	32.2	35.1	35.6	36.2
NHTSA Default Table - Col. 4 356 Standard CF from Expert AutoStats	4 356.0	34.0	1863.8	2	23.1	<b>24.7</b> 30.7	29.2 30.7 33.3	23.2	23.2 <b>24.2</b> 26.2 29.2 30.2 32.2		26.2 32.2		26.2 27.4 27.9 28.6 32.2 35.1 35.6 36.2

Table 12 - Statistical Analysis of Calculation of Impact speeds (MPH) for NHTSA Tests #1282, 1390, and 2044 based on "Generic" A-B-G Values contained in Table 11 and comparison to the Standard CF Value

	Test "Ad	Actual" Impact St 34.7 MPH	Test "Actusl" Impect Speed ≈ 34.7 MPH	Test "Act	Test "Actual" Impact Speed = 29.4 MPH	t Speed = H	Test "Ach 34	Test "Actual" Impact Speed = 35.0 MPH	Speed
		Test # 1282		,	Test # 1390	0	-	Test # 2044	
	SpeedC	Speed Calculation Based on:	Based on:	Speed	alculation	Based on:	Speed Ca	Speed Calculation Based on:	ased or
	Minimum	Average	Maximum	Minimum	Average	Maximum	Minimum	Average	Maxim
	Crush	Crush	Crush Crush Crush	Crush	Crush	Crush Crush	Cresh	Crush Crush Crush	5
Minimum	23.1	24.7	27.3	23.2	24.2	26.2	27.4	27.9	28.6
Average	27.2	29.5	33.7	27.2	28.8	31.9	34.3	35.0	36.1
Median	26.8	28.3	33.6	26.9	28.5	31.8	34.4	35.2	36.4
Medmum	30.7	33.5	38.4	30.8	32.7	36.3	39.3	40.2	41.5
Pop. Std. Dev.	2.6	3.0	3.7	2.6	2.8	3.4	4.0	4	4.3
Semple Std. Dev.	2.9	3.3	4.2	2.9	3.2	3.8	4.5	9.7	4.8
Standard CF from Expert AutoStats = 21	28.2	30.7	33.3	30.2	30.2	32.2	35.1	35.6	36.2

Table 13 - Combined Summary Table of Tables 1-5 and 7-11

. . . . .

	T Speed .	Test # 2044 Speed Calculation Besed on:	Mandmum	Ę (	. 5	37.4	37.7	Test# 2044	Meadmun	Ē,	37.4	33.4	33.2		Test# 2044 Sneed Calmidation Beand on	Mandaman	8	R 2	9 2	35.0		Test # 2044	Meximum	8	98 88	37.2	- 6	9.00		Speed Calculation Based on:	Š	41.5	38.9	36.3	36.4	38.6	36.2
	Test "Actual" Impect Speed = 35.0 MPH	Test # 204 Calculation i	Average	<b>16</b>	41.7	38.3	37.1	Test# 204	Average	5	36.0	3	32.6		Test # 204	Average	See .	8 4 4 5 4 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5	2, 2,	3 3		Test # 204	Average	5	88	5	8	Š	Test # 204	alcutefon B	Š	407	37.7	34.2	36.2	27.9	8
	A C.	Speeds	Minimum	44.8	40.8	35.5	36.6	•	Minimum	27 A	5. Y.	34.7	32.2		8	Minimum	8	55.0	3 6	33.9			Minimum	Const	36.1	35.3	¥ 1	3		Speed	S	39.3	36.8	33.5	37.7	77.4	76.4
22.8 4.7.6 17.8 19.6 19.6 19.6																																					
Mandmum 21.1 19.7 25.0 Null	ф В Т	ased on:	Average Meximum	412	37.6	32.8	33.5		Mardenam		3 %	29.4	29.4		1	Maxemum	See .	3 2	. e	31.1			Merodmum	S S	<b>8</b>	327		-		Sed on:	6	36.3	<b>3</b> .1	31.0	31.8	282	32.2
Crush in Inches n Average N 18.0 17.4 24.1 Nuff	Test Actual Impact Speed = 29.4 MPH	Test# 1390 alculation B	Average	37.0	33.8	28.6	31.5	Test # 1390	Average		29.3	8	77.7		Test # 1390 alcufadon B	Average	See .	, P	7.07	, 2 2 2 3 3	!	est # 1390	Average	S S	30.2	23.0	ě	7	est # 1390	Author Br	ğ	22.7	30.7	28.0	28.6	24.2	Ş
Minute 16.2 23.5 N.M.	1881 X	Test # 1390 Speed Celculation Based on:	Minimum	2 45 8 8 8	31.8	27.9	30.4	Test# 1390	Marina	E 8	7.77		7.92		Test # 1390 Sweet Calculation Resed on	Minimum	6	0.72	7.7	28.2		Test# 1390	Minimum	Cogg	78.5	5.7.8 1.7.8	; ;	78	<del>-</del>	Speed Calculation Based on:	Š	30.7	8.85	38.4	26.9	23.2	8
Indentation Langth 172.7 0.0 66.7 72.7																																					
Verice Wide 1727 1727 1727 1727	- peed	Ju Dese	Medimum	3 3	30.8	34.7	34.7		Medmum		è	3,1	30.5		5	Madmin	Out :	M 4	3 5 5	32.2		į	Mandmum	5	35.3	8.6	3 6	34.4		sed on:	S	38.4	36.0	32.8	33.6	27.3	***
29.4 29.4 29.4 29.3 29.3	Test "Actual" Impect Speed = 34.7 MPH	Test# 1282 Speed Calculation Besed on:	Average	5 e	34.7	30.3	32.0	Test# 1282	Average		30.1		8	į	Test # 1282	Average	Chush	20.00	t 67 %	2 2	i	Test# 1262	Average	Cass	31.0	30.3		Ž.	est # 1282	Speed Calculation Based on:	ğ	33.5	31.5	28.7	29.3	24.7	,
Wagst pounds 4110 4090 3924 4028	Test 'Ac	D peeds		34.7	31.7	8.72	30.4	-		E 6	3.5	2 2	<b>%</b>	į	- 6	Minimum	<b>E</b> 6	o. /2	0. Z	3 2		- 2	Minimum	S S	78.4	27.8	7/7	797	-	Opends .	Š	30.7	28.9	787	28.8	ឌ	į
Model Thunderbled Thunderbled Thunderbled Thunderbled			ķ	3			28		- 1	ż			17.6				გ			9.6		•	į					9			5						2
Ford Ford		•*	WGF	986	9999	9999	IVERC		ur Wath	<b>9</b> §	9 2	8638		1/200		uf Widh)	9	250	7 6	1	vsec		n Length Ori	0	983.5	983.5	258	38			6	581.1	506.3	8,T <b>8</b> 0	406.1	1963.8	
96 t 1985 98 t 1985 98 t 1985			#282 (Tu	1523	123.4	80.8	Этрh = 88	.•	H #1390 (1	• <u>\$</u>	200	8 2	!	mph = 88		1#2044 (TF	80 }	2 2	5. K	į	188 - Mail		(Indentation	8	8 4	0.0		50 = 5.0 mph = 88 in/sec			8	113.3	87.8	78.1	980	34.0	
Test# 1282 1380 2044 2047			TSA Test	416.4	373.9	319.0	), b0 = 5.		NHTSA Te	\ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \	345.6	279.3		. 60 - 5.0		AHTSA Tes	۷ }	9	1424	2	. bo = 5.0		Fest #2044	4	356.	345.3					<b>Y</b>	362.8	338.2	303.9	267.0	356.0	
		:	Values Calculated from NHTSA Test #1282 ("Full Width - FW)	Min Crush	Avg Crush	Max Crush	Test Specific CF Width = 72.7" (PW), b0 = 5.0 mph = 88 in/sec		Values Calculated from NHTSA Test #1390 ("Full Width)	5	AvaiChath	Max Crush	Test Specific CF	Width = 72.7" (FW) , b0 = 5.0 mph = 88 in/sec		Values Calculated from NHTSA Test #2044 ("Full" Width				Test Specific OF	Width = 60.2" (FW) . b0 = 5.0 mph = 88 h/sec		Calculated from NHTSA Test #2044 (Indentation Length Only - IL.)		Man	Awg Chush	MEX COST	Widh = 56.7" (IL).		<b>.</b>	AVG of FW values A	Min Crush	Ang Crush	Max Crush	NEI A & B Average Values	NHTSA Default Table - Col. 4	Propert Authoritate
		:	Valu						\$							Ne.							Values Cat												WEIA & BA	NHTSA Defa	Charlest CE from Poners

Table 14 - Derived Ford Thunderbird A-B-G & CF Values from NHTSA Test # 1282

Crush in inches Minimum Average Maximum 16.2 18.0 21.1			18.0	18.0	18.0	21.1	
on Cn Minimum 16.2	1						
Crush Indentation Length Inches N	. FW)	유				22.8	
Vehicle Width Inches 72.7	ull" Width -	ග	141.6	566.5	1274.6		th = 18.0"
Impact Speed MPH 34.7	#1282 ("Fi	മ	145.0	123.4	103.5		Average Crush depth = 18.0"
Weight pounds 4110	TSA Test	¥	202.7	373.9	513.6		Average
Year 1989	Jalues Calculated from NHTSA Test #1282 ("Full" Width - FW)	"no damage" speed	2.5 mph	5.0 mph	7.5 mph	Test Specific CF	Width = $72.7$ " (FW).
Test # 1282	Values	-					

Table 15 - Derived Ford Thunderbird A-B-G & CF Values from NHTSA Test # 1390

Table 16 - Derived Ford Thunderbird A-B-G & CF Values from NHTSA Test # 2044

		Weight	Impact Speed	Vehicle Width	Indentation Length		rush in incl	200
Test#	Year	pounds	MPH	Inches	_			Maximum
2044	1994	3924	35.0	60.2	56.7	23.5	24.1	25.0
V	alues Calculated from	NHTSA T	est #2044 (	"Full" Widt	th )			
	"no damage" speed	A	В	G	CF			
	2.5 mph	176.2	95.0	163.3			24.1	
	5.0 mph	325.2	81.0	653.2			24.1	
	7.5 mph	447.2	68.0	1469.6			24.1	
	Test Specific CF				19.6			25.0
	Width = 60.2" (FW),	Average	Crush dep	oth = 24.1"		ı		
Values Ca	liculated from NHTSA	Test #204	IA (Indonta	tion I anath	o Ombre III.			
141400 00	"no damage" speed	A	B	G G	CF	1		
	2.5 mph	187.0	_	173.4	OF .		24.1	
	5.0 mph		86.0				24.1 24.1	
	7.5 mph	474.8	72.2	1560.4				
	•	7/4.0	12.2	1000.4	19.6		24.1	25.0
	Test Specific CF				196			26.0

Table 17 - "Generic" A-B-G & CF values for 1989-1994 Ford Thunderbird

<b>"</b> G	eneric" Val	ues			_
AVG of FW values	_				
("Full" Width)	A	B	G	CF	<u></u>
2.5 mph	184.3	115.8	148.6		Average of Calculated A-B-G value
5. <b>0</b> mph	338.2	97.6	594.5		from NHTSA test numbers
7.5 mph	461.9	80.9	1337.5		1282, 1390, and 2044 ("Full" Wid
NEI A & B Average Values	267:0	88.0	405.1		
NHTSA Default Table - Col. 4	356.0	34.0	1863.8		
Standard CE from Evnot Aidol					
Standard CF from Expert Autos				21	
A-B-G values base	sed on Ave		·	21	]
A-B-G values bas	sed on Ave		·	21	
A-B-G values bas	sed on Ave	eric" A-B-G	values	21	
A-B-G values ba	sed on Ave	eric" A-B-G B	values G	21	
A-B-G values bases Statistical Analys  Minimum	sis of "Gene A 184.3	eric" A-B-G B 34.0	values G 148.6	21	
A-B-G values based Analysis Statistical Analysis Minimum Average	sis of "Gene A 184.3 321.5	B 34.0 83.3	G 148.6 869.9	21	
A-B-G values based Analysis Statistical Analysis Minimum Average Median	A 184.3 321.5 338.2	B 34.0 83.3 88.0	Values  G 148.6 869.9 594.5	21	

Table 18 - Calculation of Impact speeds (MPH) for NHTSA Tests #1282, 1390, and 2044 based on A-B-G & CF Values calculated for Test # 128

Test "Actual" Impact Speed = 35.0 MPH	Test # 2044	erion based on: Prace Maximum	Tush Crush	2.5 44.0	1.7 43.1	0.9 42.2	7.1 37.7	5.6 36.2	
Test "Actuel"   35.0	Test	Minimum Ave	Crush	41.5 4	40.8 4	40.1 4	36.6 3.	35.1	:
Test "Actual" impact Speed = 29.4 MPH	Test # 1390	Maximum	Crush	37.8	37.6	37.4	33.5	32.2	
Actual" impact Sp 29.4 MPH	lest # 139	Average	S	33.7	33.8	33.9	31.5	30.2	
Test "Act	,- (	Minimum	Crush	31.6	31.8	32.1	30.4	29.2	
Speed =		ased on. Maximum	See A	40.2	39.8	39.4	34.7	33.3	
Test "Actual" Impact Speed = 34.7 MPH	Test # 1282	Average 1	Cresh	34.7	34.7	34.7	32.0	30.7	
Test "Actu	12.0	Ainimum	C desp	31.5	31.7	32.0	30.4 32.0 34.7	29.2	
			L	:			22.8	72	
		Mr. Width	ပ	141.6	566.5	1274.6			th = 18.0"
		#1282 ("Fuff" Width - FW)	В	145.0	123.4	103.5		toStats	Crush depth = $18.0^{\circ}$
		TSA Test	4	202.7	373.9	513.6	ሁ	Expert Aut	Average
		Values Calculated from NHTSA Test	"no damage" speed	2.5 mph	5.0 mph	7.5 mph	Test Specific CF	Standard CF from Expert Au	Width = 72.7" (FW), Average

Table 19 - Calculation of Impact speeds (MPH) for NHTSA Tests #1282, 1390, and 2044 based on A-B-G & CF Values calculated for Test #139

					Test 'Act	Test "Actual" Impact Speed = 34.7 MPH	t Speed≈ 'H	Test "Ad	Test "Actual" impact Speed = 29.4 MPH	t Speed =	Test "Act	Test "Actual" Impact Speed = 35.0 MPH	五
					•	Test # 1282	~		Test # 1390			Test # 2044	-
Values Calculated from NHTSA	NHTSA	Test #1390	Test #1390 ("Fulf" Width)	_	Speed C Minimum	alcutation { Average	Speed Calculation Based on: Minimum Average Maximum	Speed C	alculation { Average	Speed Calculation Based on: Minimum Average Maximum	Speed Calculation Based on: Minimum Average Maximum	alcutation ( Average	Sased o Maxim
paads "a6emep ou,	٧	6	O	ង	S S	See	Crush	Crush	Clesh	Colego Colego	Cresh	Crush	S
2.5 mph	174	107.4	140.9		27.4	30.2	35.0	27.5	29.4	32.9	36.0	36.9	38.2
5.0 mph	315.6	88.3	563.8		27.8	30.1	34.4	27.7	29.3	32.6	35.2	36.0	37.1
7.5 mph	424.9	71.2	1268.4		27.8	30.0	33.9	27.9	29.4	32.3	34.4	35.1	36.1
Test Specific CF	<del>ل</del> لخ			17.6	28.7	28.1	30.5	26.7	27.7	29.4	32.2	32.6	33.
Standard CF from Expert /	Expert /	AutoStats		72	29.5	30.7	33.3	29.2	30.2	32.2	35.1	35.6	36.
Width = 72.7" (FW). Average Crush depth = 17.4"	Average	e Crush der	oth = 17.4"		_								

Table 20 - Calculation of Impact speeds (MPH) for NHTSA Tests #1282, 1390,

					Test "Ac	Test "Actual" Impact Speed = 34.7 MPH	Speed≍ H	Test *Ad	Test "Actual" Impact Speed = 29,4 MPH	Speed = H	Test "Act	Test "Actual" Impact Speed : 35.0 MPH	Deeds T
						Test # 1262			Test # 1390			Test # 2044	
	1		4		Speed	alculation B	msed on:	SpeedS	alcutation E	ased on:	Speed C	alculation B	o pes
no damage" speed A B G	V V	B	TUR WICH	r S	Crush	Average Crush	Crush Crush Crush	Crush		Minimum Average Maximum Crush Crush Crush	Minimum Average Maximum Crush Crush Crush	Average Crush	Mandmum Crush
2.5 mph	176.2	98	163.3		8	28.7	33.2	29.7	27.9	31.3	34.2	35.0	38.2
5.0 mph	325.2	81.0	663.2		0.72	29.4	33.6	77.1	28.7	31.8	34.3	35.0	8
7.5 mph	447.2	0.89	1469.6		27.9	30.1	33.9	28.0	29.4	32.3	34.3	35.0	38.0
Test Specific	<u>გ</u>			19.6	28.2	7.62	32.2	28.2	28.2	31.1	33.9	34.4	35.
Standard OF from Expert AutoStats	n Expert Au	toState		짂	29.2	30.7	33.3	29.2	30.2	32.2	8.		36.2

Table 21 - Calculation of Impact speeds (MPH) for NHTSA Tests #1282, 1390, and 2044 based on A-B-G & CF Values calculated for Test # 2044 (IL.)

				•	Test 7/43	Test "Actual" Impect Speed = 34.7 MPH	= peeds ±	Test "Ag	Test "Actual" Impact Speed = 29,4 MPH	= peeds =	Test "As	Test "Actual" Impact Speed 35.0 MPH	beed I
					_	est # 1282			Test # 139	_		Test # 204	
Ashane Calculated from MAT	YA Tast #7	744 (bylante	e de la contraction de la cont		Speed C	icutation 8	Speed Calcutation Based on:	Speed C	alculation (	Speed Calculation Based on: Minimum Avence Maximum	Speed C	Speed Calculation Based on: Minimum Average Manimum	Markins
"no damage" speed A B G GF	V P	8	9	. 1	Sec	5	Crush	Crush	Š	Crush	S C	S	S
2.5 mph	187.0	100.9	173.4		28.9	29.6	34.2	27.0	28.8	32.2	36.2	36.1	37.3
5.0 mph 34	345.3	98.0	663.5		8.72	30.3	34.6	27.9	29.6	32.7	35.3	36.1	37.2
7.5 mph	474.8	72.2	1580.4		7.92	31.0	34.9	28.8	30.3	33.2	35.4	36.1	37.1
Test Specif	S C			19.6	28.2	79.7	32.2	28.2	29.2	31.1	33.9	34.4	35.0
Sandard OF It	from Expert AutoStats	untoStarts			29.2	30.7	33.3	29.2	30.2	32.2	35.1	35.6	36.2

Table 22 - Calculation of Impact speeds (MPH) for NHTSA Tests #1282, 1390, and 2044 based on "Generic" A-B-G & CF Values

	43.4 IVILTI	.00	SOLU MIPE
Test # 1390		ES T	Test # 2044
Calculation B	lased on:	Speed Calc	ulation Based
im Average	Maximum	Minimum A	verage Maxin
Country	Crush	Code	State of
30.4	34.1	37.4	38.2 39
30.7	34.1	36.9	37.7 38
31.0	34.0	36.4	37.1 38
28.5	31.8	34.4	35.2 38
24.2	26.2	27.4	27.9 28
30.2	32.2	35.1	35.6 36
Cush         Crush         Crush         Crush           28.4         31.3         36.3         28.5           28.9         31.5         36.1         28.9           29.3         31.7         35.8         29.4           29.3         33.6         26.9         26.9           29.1         24.7         27.3         23.2           29.2         30.7         33.3         29.2		Crush Crush Crush Crush 36.3 28.5 30.4 34.1 36.1 28.9 30.7 34.1 35.8 28.5 31.8 27.3 28.2 24.2 28.2 33.3 29.2 30.2 32.2	

Table 23 - Statistical Analysis of Calculation of Impact speeds (MPH) for NHTSA Tests #1282, 1390, and 2044 based on "Generic" A-B-G Values contained in Table 22 and comparison to the Standard CF Value

	Test "Ad	Test "Actual" Impact Speed = 34.7 MPH	# Speed =	Test "Act	Test "Actual" Impact Speed = 29.4 MPH	t Speed =	Test "Act.	Test "Actual" Impact Speed * 35.0 MPH	E Speed
		Test # 1282	5	•	Test # 1390	0	<b>—</b>	Test # 2044	_
	SpeedC	Speed Calculation Based on:	Based on:	SpeedS	Speed Calculation Based on:	Based on:	Speed C	Speed Calculation Based on	ased or
	Minimum	Average	Minimum Average Maximum	Minimom	Average	Minimum Average Maximum	Minimum	Minimum Average Maximum	Maxim
	S S S S S S S S S S S S S S S S S S S	Ses F	Crush	Crush	C See	Cresh	Crush	C Ges	2
Minimum	23.1	24.7	27.3	23.2	24.2	26.2	27.4	27.9	28.6
Average	27.3	29.7	33.8	27.4	29.0	32.0	34.5	35.2	36.3
Median	28.4	31.3	35.8	28.5	30.4	34.0	36.4	37.1	38.2
Maodmum	29.3	31.7	36.3	29.4	31.0	34.1	37.4	38.2	39.6
Poo Sid. Dev	23	2.7	3.4	2.3	2.5	3.1	3.7	3.8	0.4
Sample Std. Dev.	2.5	3.0	3.8	2.5	2.8	3.4	1.1	4.3	A.
Standard CF from Expert AutoStats = 21	28.2	30.7	33.3	30.2	30.2	32.2	35.1	35.6	36.2

Table 24 - Combined Summary Table of Tables 14-22

Test Minimum Average Madrum CF 16.2 18.0 21.1 22.8 16.2 17.4 19.7 17.6 23.5 24.1 25.0 19.6 Na Na Na Ra ERR	Test 'Actus" Impact Speed = Test 'Actus" Impact Speed = 29.4 MPH 35.0 MPH	Test # 1390 Test # 2044		Crush Crush Crush Crush Crush Crush Crush		37.6 40.8	37.4 40.9	30.4 31.5 33.5 38.6 37.1 37.7	Test # 1390 Test # 2044	Speed Calcutefon Based on: Speed Calcutefon Base		36.0 36.9	32.6	34.4 35.1	26.7 27.7 29.4 32.2 32.6 33.2		Street Catalinin Beard or: Street Catalinin Broad or:			207 242 250	29.4 323 343 35.0	33.9 34.4	TO SERVE STORE	Speed Calculation B			29.6 32.7 35.3 36.1	30.3 33.2 35.4 35.1	28.2 28.2 31.1 33.9 34.4 35.0			Crush Marmum Crush		34.1	31.0 340 363 37.1	31.8 34.4 35.2	23.2 24.2 28.2 27.4 27.9 28.6
Weight Speed Witch Identification Potential Association (Control Association A	Test "Actus" impact Speed = 34,7 MPH	Test # 1262				31.7 34.7 39.8	34.7	30.4 32.0 34.7		Speed Calcutation Based on:			27.8 30.1 34.4	27.8 30.0 33.9	26.7 28.1 30.5		Test # 1282 Breed Calculation Breed on:			7.07	30.1	29.7 32.2		Speed Calculation Based on:			30.3	31.0	28.2 29.7 32.2	Test# 1282				31.5	31.7	29.3	Za. 24.7 27.3
Test # Year Mates Model 1282 1999 Ford Thurderts 1380 1990 Ford Thurderts 2044 1994 Ford Thurderts 2047 1994 Ford Thurderts		AI ABG values are calculated from AVERAGE crush		no demage speed A B G CF	202.7 146.0 141.6	373.9 123.4 586.6		Test Specific CF 22.8 Width = 72.7° (FW), Average Charl depth = 18.0°			To demage" speed A B G CF		315,6 88.3 663.8	424.9 71.2 1268.4	Test Specific CF 17.8	Average Chush depth = 17.4*			ង		2 0	į			To demand from the speed A B G CF		980	4	Test Specific CF 19.6 Width = 56.7* (IL), Average Chush depth = 24.1*			9	116.8 146.7	336.2 97.6 596.3			366.0 34.0 1863.8
		All ABG values are calc	F44	peeds ademap ou.	25 mph	5.0 mph	7.5 mph (	Test Specific CF Width = 72.7" (FW), 1		Veter Catatrata from M	peads ademap ou	25 mph	5.0 mph 2	7.5 mph	Test Specific CF	Width = 72.7" (FW), ,		Values Calculated from NP	beeds "egemab ort	udu 67		Test Specific CF	Wdm = 50.2 (FW),		beeqs "egamet or"	25 mph 1		7.5 mph 4	Test Specific CF Width = 56.7" (IL), As		2	"no damage" speed	2.5 mph(AVG-FW) 1				NHTSA Default Table - Col. 4 3